

Minutes

Sunderland City Council

At a meeting of SUNDERLAND CITY COUNCIL held in the CIVIC CENTRE on
WEDNESDAY, 20 JUNE, 2018 at 6.00 p.m.

Present: The Mayor (Councillor L. Scanlan) in the Chair
The Deputy Mayor (Councillor D. Snowdon)

Councillors	Appleby	Fletcher	MacKnight, N	Speding
	Atkinson	Foster	Marshall	Taylor
	Ball	Francis	McClennan	Trueman, D
	Beck	Galbraith	Miller, F	Trueman, H
	Bell	Gibson, E	Miller, G.	Turner
	Blackburn	Gibson, P.	Mordey	Tye
	Blackett	Haswell	O'Brien	Walker, G.
	Chequer	Heron	Oliver	Walker, P
	Cunningham	Hodson	O'Neil	Waller
	Curran	Hunt	Porthouse	Waters
	Davison	Jackson	Samuels	Watson
	Dixon, D.	Johnston	Scaplehorn	Williams
	Dixon, M	Kelly	Scullion	Wilson, A.
	English	Lauchlan	Smith, G	Wilson, D.
	Essl	Leadbitter	Smith, P	Wood, K.
	Farthing	MacKnight, D	Snowdon, D.E.	Wood, P.

Also Present:-

Honorary Aldermen: - M. Forbes and R.D. Tate.

The notice convening the meeting was read.

Minutes

Councillor Lauchlan advised that in respect of the election of the Leader of the Council, he had been recorded as having abstained from voting on the motion that Councillor Hodson be elected as Leader, whereas he had intended to vote against the motion.

7. RESOLVED that the minutes of the Meeting of the Council held on 16 May, 2018 (copy circulated), be confirmed and signed as a correct record.

Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of interest.

Announcements

The Mayor made the following announcements:

(i) Northern Spire Bridge

At the invitation of the Mayor, Councillor A. Wilson informed Members that there had been six awards received in relation to the Northern Spire Bridge. These included the Institution of Civil Engineers (ICE) North East Robert Stephenson Award and the ICE 200 Special Project Award 2018 for the overall project; a special award given to reflect how impressed the ICE had been with the project, to celebrate the project and to mark the 200th anniversary of the ICE. The Chartered Institute of Public Relations (CIPR) Pride Award 2017 had seen the project given the silver award for regional campaign of the year for media, public relations, social media, engagement, video and photography. The Gold site award had been given at the Considerate Constructors 2018 Awards for efforts made by the team to go above and beyond in being considerate contractors to community, neighbours, employees and sub-contractors. At the Chartered Institution of Highways and Transport/Causeway Awards 2018 held in London the project had received the Commendation for Major Project Award. The National Association of Scaffolding Contractors had awarded Interlink Scaffolding Ltd the Project of the Year Award for their work on the bridge.

(ii) Trading Standards Award

At the invitation of the Mayor, Councillor A. Wilson informed Members that the Council's Trading Standards department had been rated third best in the country for food hygiene by Which Magazine. The food safety enforcement and the star ratings process had been reported and compared with the other authorities across the country. It was a great achievement for Sunderland to have been placed third, as the other authorities in the top 10 were mostly rural authorities. Environmental Health would continue to ensure the food sold in the city was safe for residents.

(iii) Chief Executive

The Mayor highlighted that this meeting would be the last meeting for the Council's Chief Executive Irene Lucas CBE, subject to the Council approving the report of the Human Resources Committee. The Mayor highlighted the key achievements in Ms Lucas' career and thanked her for her services. The Leader of the Council, Councillor G. Miller; Councillor Oliver and Councillor Hodson all then delivered speeches thanking Ms Lucas for her hard work and dedication to the Council over her distinguished career.

Reception of Petitions

8. RESOLVED that the petitions listed below submitted by the Councillors named, be received and referred for consideration in accordance with the Council's Petitions Scheme: -

Councillor Heron – Petition from residents of Fence Houses objecting to more houses being built on the old Dubmire School site. Residents were concerned that this was the only green space left in the area; it was used by residents and children during the summer months and by children as part of their safe journey to school.

Councillor Haswell – Petition from residents asking for funding to be made available for works to the back lane of St Luke's Road to prevent access in order to prevent crime and antisocial behaviour from occurring in the back lane and the adjacent field.

Apologies for Absence

Apologies for absence were submitted to the meeting on behalf of Councillors Elliott, Howe, Lawson, Mullen, Rowntree, Stewart, Turton and A. Wood and on behalf of Aldermen Arnott and Greenfield.

Written Questions under Rule 9

Pursuant to Rule 9 of the Council Rules of Procedure, the Leader and Members of the Executive were asked questions which had been submitted by members of the public.

Report of the Cabinet

The Cabinet reported and recommended as follows:-

1. Youth Justice Plan 2017/18

That they had given consideration to a report of the Executive Director of People Services (copy attached) on the Youth Justice Plan 2017/2018 which set out the principal aim of the Sunderland Youth offending Service to 'prevent offending and re-offending by children and young people'. It also set out the key related outcomes of reducing the numbers of first time entrants to the criminal justice system, reducing the proven rate of re-offending for children and young people and maintaining a low use of custody as well as service development priorities and achievements.

The Cabinet noted the contents of the report and the Youth Justice Plan 2017/18 and agreed that the plan be referred to the Children, Education and Skills Scrutiny Committee for further advice and consideration in accordance with Article 4 of the Council's Constitution. In addition the Cabinet gave delegated authority to the Executive Director of Peoples Services, in consultation with the Portfolio Holder for Children's Services, to accept any amendments to the plan prior to being referred to Council for final approval.

The Children, Education and Skills Scrutiny Committee welcomed the Youth Justice Plan 2017/2018 and supported the Cabinet's recommendation to submit the Plan to Council for final approval.

Accordingly the Cabinet recommended the Council to approve the Youth Justice Plan 2017/2018.

The Leader of the Council, Councillor G. Miller, duly seconded by the Deputy Leader, Councillor Mordey, moved the report of the Cabinet and it was:-

9. RESOLVED that the Youth Justice Plan 2017/18 be approved.

Report of the Human Resources Committee

The Human Resources Committee reported and recommended as follows:-

1. Appointment of Chief Executive

Council was recommended to appoint Patrick Melia to the post of Chief Executive, together with the positions of Council Returning Officer and Electoral Registration Officer, with effect from 1 August 2018 and to authorise the Head of Human Resources and Organisational Development, in consultation with the Leader, to conclude the arrangements.

The Leader of the Council, Councillor G. Miller, duly seconded by the Deputy Leader, Councillor Mordey, moved the report of the Human Resources Committee and confirmed that neither he nor any other Member of the Executive had any objections to the appointment of Patrick Melia as Chief Executive, together with the positions of Returning Officer and Electoral Registration Office. Accordingly, it was:-

10. RESOLVED that the appointment of Mr Patrick Melia to the post of Chief Executive, together with the positions of Council Returning Officer and Electoral Registration Officer, with effect from 1st August 2018, be approved.

Area Arrangements Annual Report 2017/18

The Director of Strategy, Partnerships and Transformation submitted the combined Area Committee Annual Report which summarised the work of the five Area Committees during 2017/2018.

Councillor Kelly, duly seconded by Councillor P. Walker, moved the combined Annual Report of the Area Committees and accordingly it was: -

11. RESOLVED that the achievements and impact of the work of the Area Committees and their supporting People and Place Boards during 2017/2018, as outlined in the Annual Report, be received and noted.

Scrutiny Annual Report 2017/2018

The Director of Strategy, Partnerships and Transformation submitted the Scrutiny Annual Report which summarised the work of the Scrutiny Committees during 2017/2018.

Councillor D.E. Snowden, duly seconded by Councillor Hunt, moved the Annual Report of the Scrutiny Committees and accordingly it was: -

12. RESOLVED that the operation, achievements and impact of the Scrutiny Committees during 2017/2018 as outlined in the report, be received and noted.

Written Questions under Rule 10.2

Pursuant to Rule 10.2 of the Council Rules of Procedure, Members of the Council asked questions of the Leader and Members of the Executive.

Councillor Oliver moved an extension to the time for responding to written questions which was duly seconded. Upon being put to the vote the motion was defeated with:-
10 Members voting in favour:-

Councillors	Blackett	Haswell	O'Brien	Smith, G.
	Dixon, M.	Hodson	Oliver	Wood, P.
	Francis	Leadbitter		

And 52 Members voting against:-

Councillors	Atkinson	Fletcher	McClennan	Taylor
	Ball	Foster	Miller, F	Trueman, D
	Beck	Galbraith	Miller, G.	Trueman, H
	Bell	Gibson, E	Mordey	Turner
	Blackburn	Gibson, P.	O'Neil	Tye
	Chequer	Heron	Porthouse	Walker, G.
	Cunningham	Jackson	Samuels	Walker, P
	Curran	Johnston	Scaplehorn	Waller
	Davison	Kelly	Scullion	Watson
	Dixon, D.	Lauchlan	Smith, P	Williams
	English	MacKnight, D	Snowdon, D.	Wilson, A.
	Essl	MacKnight, N	Snowdon, D.E.	Wilson, D.
	Farthing	Marshall	Speding	Wood, K.

Action on Petitions

The Council received and noted the report below which detailed the action taken in relation to the following petitions which had been presented to the Council at its meetings held on 24 January, 2018 and 21 June, 2017 respectively.

(i) Petition to Council with regard to an application for a licence to sell alcohol at the former Cauld Lad Public House – Presented to Council on 24 January 2018

In accordance with the Council's procedures, the petition was reported to the Licensing Sub-Committee on 22 February 2018.

The Sub-Committee considered the petition and other evidence and decided to grant the application for a licence. In doing so, the Sub-Committee stated that they took into account the Council's Statement of Licensing Policy and the fact that the police were content with the application. The Sub-Committee considered that there were sufficient conditions proposed as to the method of operation of the premises in order to prevent problems arising and that the evidence of anti-social behaviour put forward could not be directly attributed to the sale of alcohol.

In accordance with the law, a notice of this determination, which gave details of the reasoning for the decision of the Sub-Committee, had been given to the lead petitioner.

The Ward Councillors and lead petitioner had been advised of the outcome.

(ii) Petition to Provide a Bus Service to Gildacre Fields, Southwick - Presented to Council on 24 January 2018

In advance of the petition being received, this matter had also been raised by the former Southwick Ward Councillor, Norma Wright. As a consequence of this a meeting was held on site on 10 January 2018. This was attended by the Ward Councillors, Gildacre Fields residents, and officers from Stagecoach, Nexus and the City Council.

Residents were given the opportunity to outline the difficulties they encountered due to the lack of easy access to a bus service.

Stagecoach responded that they were prepared to divert service 16 along Faber Road and Emsworth Road instead of Shakespeare Street. This was, however conditional on changes that had recently occurred in Redhill Ward proving successful and not unduly inconveniencing residents there.

Discussions with Redhill Ward Councillors suggested that in general they would have no objection to a diversion to serve Gildacre Fields. However there were anecdotal reports of difficulties for residents in the Bunny Hill area and they requested that the position continue to be monitored in relation to any potential negative impact on residents there.

As a result of this, Stagecoach was proposing to divert service 16 to serve Gildacre Fields with effect from the June/July timetable change. This would be subject to bus stops being installed and that the change would be monitored both to ensure that there are no negative effects elsewhere on the route, particularly further out in Redhill and also to ensure that the new stops were well used. Nexus were currently making arrangements for new bus stops on Faber Road outside of Gildacre Fields.

The Ward Councillors and lead petitioner had been advised of the outcome.

(iii) Petition to install bollards or a traffic management scheme at Kingarth Avenue, Prince's Avenue, Queen's Avenue, King's Avenue and Prince's Avenue - Presented to Council on 21 June 2017

After consideration by Council Officers, the outcome of the petition was as follows:-

To decline the element of the petition requesting the installation of bollards but that this area be included within a new programme of Community Parking Management Schemes to be considered by Planning and Highways Committee in 2018- 2019.

In addition, options would be considered for further Traffic Management mitigation in parallel with proposals for the mixed use development to the west of Whitburn Road and north of Dykelands Road.

The Ward Councillors and lead petitioner had been advised of the outcome.

Notices of Motion

(i) North of Tyne Devolution

Councillor Oliver, duly seconded by Councillor P. Wood, moved the following motion:-

“This Council regrets that Sunderland is not part of the North of Tyne devolution deal and urges Council leaders to make all necessary efforts to ensure that the city is not left behind in any future devolution deals”.

Upon being put to the vote the motion was defeated with 11 Members voting in favour:-

Councillors	Appleby Blackett Dixon, M.	Francis Haswell Hodson	Leadbitter O'Brien Oliver	Smith, G. Wood, P.
-------------	----------------------------------	------------------------------	---------------------------------	-----------------------

And 52 Members voting against:-

Councillors	Atkinson Ball Beck Bell Blackburn Chequer Cunningham Curran Davison Dixon, D. English Essl Farthing	Fletcher Foster Galbraith Gibson, E Gibson, P. Heron Hunt Johnston Kelly Lauchlan MacKnight, D MacKnight, N Marshall	McClennan Miller, F Miller, G. Mordey O'Neil Porthouse Samuels Scaplehorn Scullion Smith, P Snowdon, D. Snowdon, D.E. Speding	Taylor Trueman, D Trueman, H Turner Tye Walker, G. Walker, P Waller Watson Williams Wilson, A. Wilson, D. Wood, K.
-------------	---	--	---	--

(ii) Urgent Care Consultation

Councillor Chequer, duly seconded by Councillor G Walker, moved the following motion:-

“Access to healthcare is a right of all in a modern society and this must be guaranteed.

This Labour Council, therefore, opposes the intention of Sunderland CCG to downgrade the Urgent Care Services at Houghton-Le-Spring, Bunnyhill and Washington to extended hours GP provision only, and resolves immediately to inform the CCG of its intentions to:

Engage constructively with them in relation to their consultation with residents regarding local Urgent Care services.

- Mandate group leaders and officers to liaise and make every effort to establish a consensus to best represent residents affected by the consultation.
- Identify and give immediate and urgent consideration to any necessary actions, including consideration of judicial review, relating to the Urgent Care services review.
- Involve stakeholders, so as to secure the best possible overall Urgent Care outcomes for residents”.

Councillor Oliver, duly seconded by Councillor Francis, moved an amendment to the motion so that the word “Labour” would be deleted from the third line of the motion.

So that the amended Motion would read:-

“Access to healthcare is a right of all in a modern society and this must be guaranteed.

This Council, therefore, opposes the intention of Sunderland CCG to downgrade the Urgent Care Services at Houghton-Le-Spring, Bunnyhill and Washington to extended hours GP provision only, and resolves immediately to inform the CCG of its intentions to:

- Engage constructively with them in relation to their consultation with residents regarding local Urgent Care services.
- Mandate group leaders and officers to liaise and make every effort to establish a consensus to best represent residents affected by the consultation.
- Identify and give immediate and urgent consideration to any necessary actions, including consideration of judicial review, relating to the Urgent Care services review.
- Involve stakeholders, so as to secure the best possible overall Urgent Care outcomes for residents”.

Following the speeches from Members, the Mayor invited Councillor D. Dixon to address Members. Councillor D. Dixon advised that he was Chairman of the Health and Wellbeing Scrutiny Committee that would be considering this proposal. Members of the Health and Wellbeing Scrutiny Committee should be aware that they needed to have an open mind when considering the matter at the Scrutiny Committee and as such should give consideration to refraining from commenting on or voting on this Motion.

It having been indicated to the meeting that the proposed amendment was accepted, Councillor Mordey then asked for a named vote to be taken on the Motion, as altered.

Upon being put to the vote the motion was carried with 54 Members voting in favour:-

Councillors	Appleby	Foster	Miller, G.	Trueman, H
	Atkinson	Francis	Mordey	Turner
	Ball	Galbraith	O'Brien	Tye
	Bell	Gibson, E	Oliver	Walker, G.
	Blackburn	Gibson, P.	O'Neil	Walker, P
	Blackett	Haswell	Porthouse	Waller
	Chequer	Heron	Samuels	Watson
	Cunningham	Hodson	Scaplehorn	Williams
	Curran	Johnston	Scullion	Wilson, A.
	Dixon, M	Kelly	Smith, G	Wilson, D.
	English	Lauchlan	Smith, P	Wood, K.
	Essl	MacKnight, D	Speding	Wood, P.
	Farthing	Marshall	Taylor	
	Fletcher	Miller, F	Trueman, D	

And 9 Members abstaining:-

Councillors	Beck	Hunt	MacKnight, N.	Snowdon, D.
	Davison	Leadbitter	McClennan	Snowdon, D.E.
	Dixon, D.			

Accordingly it was:-

13. RESOLVED that access to healthcare is a right of all in a modern society and this must be guaranteed.

This Council, therefore, opposes the intention of Sunderland CCG to downgrade the Urgent Care Services at Houghton-Le-Spring, Bunnyhill and Washington to extended hours GP provision only, and resolves immediately to inform the CCG of its intentions to:

- Engage constructively with them in relation to their consultation with residents regarding local Urgent Care services.
- Mandate group leaders and officers to liaise and make every effort to establish a consensus to best represent residents affected by the consultation.
- Identify and give immediate and urgent consideration to any necessary actions, including consideration of judicial review, relating to the Urgent Care services review.
- Involve stakeholders, so as to secure the best possible overall Urgent Care outcomes for residents.

Update on Special Urgency Decisions

The Leader of the Council submitted a quarterly report on executive decisions which had been taken as a matter of special urgency which advised that there had been no such instances since the last report.

The Leader of the Council, Councillor G. Miller, duly seconded by the Deputy Leader, Councillor Mordey, moved the report.

14. RESOLVED that the report be received and noted.

Appointments to Committees and Outside Bodies

The Head of Law and Governance submitted a report which requested the Council to consider changes in appointments to a number of Committees, Sub-committees and Outside Bodies.

Councillor Hodson, duly seconded by Councillor O'Brien, moved an amendment to the supplementary report, namely that Councillor Haswell should be appointed to the Gentoo Operations Committee instead of Councillor Samuels. This amendment was put to the vote and with 5 Members voting in favour:-

Councillors	Appleby Haswell	Hodson	O'Brien	Smith, G.
-------------	--------------------	--------	---------	-----------

And 55 Members voting against:-

Councillors	Atkinson	Fletcher	Marshall	Taylor
	Ball	Foster	McClennan	Trueman, D
	Beck	Francis	Miller, F	Trueman, H
	Bell	Galbraith	Miller, G.	Turner
	Blackburn	Gibson, E	Mordey	Tye
	Blackett	Gibson, P.	Oliver	Walker, G.
	Chequer	Heron	O'Neil	Walker, P
	Cunningham	Hunt	Porthouse	Waller
	Curran	Johnston	Samuels	Williams
	Davison	Kelly	Scullion	Wilson, A.
	Dixon, D.	Lauchlan	Smith, P	Wilson, D.
	English	Leadbitter	Snowdon, D.	Wood, K.
	Essl	MacKnight, D	Snowdon, D.E.	Wood, P.
	Farthing	MacKnight, N.	Speding	

The amendment was defeated.

The Leader of the Council, Councillor G. Miller, duly seconded by the Deputy Leader, Councillor Mordey, moved that the recommendations contained in the report and supplementary report be approved and it was: -

15. RESOLVED that:-

- (i) Councillor H. Trueman be appointed in place of Councillor G. Walker on the Audit and Governance Committee;
- (ii) Councillors Rowntree and Williams be appointed in place of Councillors F. Miller and Turner on the Planning and Highways Committee and the Development Control (Hetton, Houghton and Washington) Sub-Committee;
- (iii) Councillor Essl be appointed in place of Councillor Foster on the Development Control (North Sunderland) Sub-Committee;
- (iv) Councillor O'Neil be appointed in place of Councillor McClennan on the Chance Project;
- (v) Councillor D. Dixon be appointed in place of Councillor Heron on the Northumberland, Tyne and Wear and North Durham STP Joint Health Scrutiny Committee;
- (vi) Councillor Scanlan be appointed in place of Councillor N. MacKnight on the Sunderland and North Durham Royal Society for the Blind Management Committee;
- (vii) The appointment by the Leader of Councillors Ball and D. MacKnight as substitute members in place of Councillors D. Snowden and Waters on the Tyne and Wear Trading Standards Joint Committee be noted;
- (viii) Councillor Fletcher be appointed in place of Councillor Middleton on the Health and Wellbeing Scrutiny Committee;
- (ix) Councillor Farthing be appointed in place of Councillor Middleton on the Planning and Highways Committee;
- (x) Councillor K. Wood be appointed in place of Councillor Middleton on the Education (Appointment of Governors) Panel;
- (xi) Councillor H. Trueman be appointed in place of Councillor Middleton as the representative of the Washington Area People Board on the Corporate Parenting Board;
- (xii) Councillor H. Trueman be appointed in place of Councillor Middleton as Alternate Vice Chairman (People) of the Washington Area Committee;
- (xiii) Councillor H. Trueman be appointed in place of Councillor Middleton as the as Alternate Vice Chairman (People) on the Children's Centres Local Advisory Partnership Board – Washington; and
- (xiv) Councillor Samuels be appointed in place of Councillor Middleton on the Gentoo Operations Committee.

(Signed) L. SCANLAN,
Mayor.