

**At a meeting of the SCRUTINY COMMITTEE held in the CIVIC CENTRE  
SUNDERLAND on THURSDAY, 14<sup>th</sup> APRIL, 2016 at 5.30 p.m.**

**Present:-**

Councillor N. Wright in the Chair

Councillors Davison, Fletcher, Howe, Scanlan, David Snowdon and Dianne Snowdon.

Also in attendance:-

Councillor Farthing (observing)

Ms Debbie Burnicle, Deputy Officer, Sunderland Clinical Commissioning Group (CCG)

Mr Les Clark, Chief Operating Officer, Place, Sunderland City Council

Mr Nigel Cummings, Scrutiny Officer, Sunderland City Council

Mr Jim Diamond, Scrutiny Officer, Sunderland City Council

Mr Iain Fairlamb, Head of Planning and Regeneration, Sunderland City Council

Ms Ros Goode, NHS England

Mr David Noon, Principal Governance Services Officer, Sunderland City Council

Dr Jeff Stephenson, Sunderland CCG

**Apologies for Absence**

Apologies for absence were submitted to the meeting on behalf of Councillor D. Dixon.

**Minutes of the last Meeting of the Committee held on 10<sup>th</sup> March, 2016**

1. RESOLVED that the minutes of the last ordinary meeting of the Scrutiny Committee held on 10<sup>th</sup> March, 2016 (copy circulated) be confirmed and signed as a correct record

**Declarations of Interest (including Whipping Declarations)**

Item 4 Sunderland APMS Procurement

Councillors David and Dianne Snowdon declared an interest in the matter as patients of the Barmston Medical Centre.

Councillor Farthing declared an interest as a patient registered with Encompass Healthcare.

## **Reference from Cabinet – 23<sup>rd</sup> March 2016, Sunderland Local Plan Core Strategy: Consultation on Growth Options**

The Head of Law and Governance submitted a report (copy circulated) appending a report considered by Cabinet on 23 March 2016 which had sought approval of the Core Strategy Growth Options document and permission to undertake formal public consultation on the Growth Options. The report had been referred to the Planning and Highways and Scrutiny Committees to allow members views to contribute to the consultation process.

(For copy report – see original minutes).

Iain Fairlamb, Head of Planning and Regeneration presented the report and together with Les Clark, Chief Operating Officer, Place, addressed questions and comments from members thereon.

Members expressed the following views on the report:-

- i) Disappointment at the pressure to release green belt land for development and a wish that wherever possible the potential to release development land without eroding green space was maximised
- ii) Given the current pace of growth (the IAMP, New Wear Crossing, Keel Square/Vaux site, new hotels and the development of the port) the Core Strategy would need to be flexible and provide an element of future proofing
- iii) Concern at the current outward migration from the city and a desire to see it reversed
- iv) Pressure to remove existing rights of way and footpaths should be resisted
- v) Where possible the re use of existing brown field sites should be maximised.
- vi) The consultation on the growth option should be designed to so it was as easy as possible for the maximum number of residents and interested parties to access and that enough information was provided in order that people could make their own value judgements on the proposals. The wider the participation the better the outcomes would be.

The Chairman having thanked Mr Fairlamb and Mr Clarke for their attendance, it was:-

2. RESOLVED that:-

- i) Members comments be considered as part of the consultation process;
- ii) The importance of the Core Strategy Growth Options document and the formal public consultation be recognised and that further updates be submitted to the appropriated Scrutiny in due course.

## **Sunderland APMS Procurement Sunderland Care and Support Ltd – Update**

The Chief Operating Officer submitted a report (copy circulated) to update the Committee on Sunderland CCG's decision to re-procure three Alternative Provider for Medical Services contracts in Sunderland which were due to terminate in the contract year 2016.

(For copy report – see original minutes).

Ms Debbie Burnicle presented the report and informed Members that the CCG was of the view that the proposal to re-procure the APMS contracts did not constitute a significant variation of NHS services as GP services would continue to be delivered in the three sites: The Galleries, Westerhope Road and Pennywell Shopping Precinct. However, in the spirit of the legislation the CCG wanted to engage with the affected patient population and stakeholders about the procurement.

Therefore during September and October 2015, the SCCG carried out a communications and listening exercise with patients and stakeholders. A range of methods were used to capture views and experiences as well as suggestions, questions, comments and concerns.

Patients registered with Encompass Healthcare, Pennywell Medical Centre and Barmston Medical practices to give them information and answer any questions, to reassure them that commissioned services would continue to be provided and noted that the CCG would take account of any feedback in the procurement process. All registered patients received a letter explaining the procurement process together with a patient information sheet, survey and invitation to attend drop-in sessions and /or comment on line or in writing. Briefings were also made to a range of stakeholders and information sessions held for Councillors from Washington and the West localities as well as attending before the Scrutiny Committee.

Following the engagement the CCG wrote formally to patients to let them know all the questions asked and comments made, along with answers to any questions raised. The outcomes of the engagement were also shared with the Primary Care Commissioning Committee (the decision making body). The Committee agreed to continue to progress the procurement as per the original timeframe.

Shortly after the engagement exercise concluded however, the CCG became aware that the current providers had not signed the contract variation to extend the contracts by 6 months and wanted to meet the CCG to discuss options. Meetings were held with both providers, and whilst the CCG were willing to listen and consider their concerns, the focus was on the need to have services in place between April and September 2016 for patients. Providers' views would be captured as part of the formal procurement process, ensuring a fair process for any potential provider. The Primary Care Committee were of the view therefore that the tender exercise needed to continue, therefore an emergency procurement had to be put in place for 6 months.

The Chairman thanked Ms Burnicle for her report and invited questions and comments from members.

Councillor Scanlan asked that if any provider failed to deliver could the CCG intervene. Ms Burnicle advised that it could. There were penalty clauses in the contract and performance was monitored. Dr Stephenson added that there were procedures written into all the contracts to remedy breaches with the ultimate sanction that the contract would be withdrawn.

In response to an enquiry from Councillor Dianne Snowdon, Ms Burnicle confirmed that the emergency contract was paid at a higher rate however the new contract would bring it back into line.

The Chairman referred to paragraph 5.4 of the report and asked what had been the nature of the issues raised by patients in their letters to Healthwatch. Ms Burnicle replied that the majority had sought reassurance that their practice was continuing and that services would not be changing. Positive comments had also been received in respect of two members of staff from Encompass and there had also been details of previous concerns raised in respect of another provider.

There being no further questions or comments the Chairman thanked Ms Burnicle, Dr Stephenson and Ms Goode for their attendance and it was:-

3. RESOLVED that the report be received and noted and that further update reports be submitted to the appropriate Scrutiny Committee in due course.

### **Scrutiny Policy Reviews 2015/16**

The Head of Scrutiny and Area Arrangements submitted a report (copy circulated) which provided the Committee with the draft recommendations from the following Scrutiny Policy Reviews undertaken by the Lead Scrutiny Members and their supporting panels / Shadow Committee as detailed in appendices A to D of the Report.

<b>Shadow Scrutiny Committee</b>	<b>Policy Review</b>
Health and Wellbeing	Moving On: The Transition from Child to Adult Social Care Services (Report A)
Health and Wellbeing	Review of Core Sexual Health Services in Sunderland (Report B)
Economic Prosperity	The Approach to Environmental Enforcement (Report C)
Economy and Prosperity	The Use of Customer Feedback (Report D)

(For copy report – see original minutes).

The Scrutiny Lead Members then briefly introduced the reports of the Panels within their purview and consideration was given thereto.

The Chairman in conjunction with the Lead Scrutiny members made various suggested amendments to strengthen certain recommendations. Nigel Cummings, Scrutiny Officer advised that he taken note of the comments and would amend the recommendations accordingly. He would then circulate the revised drafts to the Chairman and relevant Lead Scrutiny Member for approval prior to submission to Cabinet.

The Chairman having thanked the members of the Scrutiny Panels / Shadow Committees and all the Officers who had supported the Scrutiny function and its meetings throughout 2015/16 it was:-

4. RESOLVED that the Scrutiny Policy Reviews as detailed in appendices A to D of the report, as amended be endorsed and that the Review Reports be referred as follows:-

- (i) 4 Policy Review Reports to Cabinet at its meeting in June 2016 and;
- (ii) 4 Policy Review Reports to Cabinet at its meeting in July 2016.

### **Annual report 2015/2016**

The Chief Executive submitted a report (copy circulated) providing the Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to consider the draft Scrutiny Annual Report for the Municipal Year 2015/16.

(For copy report – see original minutes).

Nigel Cummings, Scrutiny Officer, advised that at this stage, as the report was still in draft form, if members had any further comments for inclusion there would be time to include them if they contacted him as soon as possible.

The Chairman having advised that she would like to see a reference on page 4 in respect of the Ofsted inspection of Children's Services, it was:-

5. RESOLVED that the report be endorsed for submission to the first meeting of the Council in the new Municipal Year and for subsequent circulation to key stakeholders.

### **Notice of Key Decisions**

The Head of Scrutiny and Area Arrangements submitted a report (copy circulated) providing Members with an opportunity to consider those items on the Executive's Notice of Key Decisions for the 28 day period from 22<sup>nd</sup> March together with the Notice for the period from 11<sup>th</sup> April 2016 issued following the publication of the agenda (copy tabled).

(For copy report – see original minutes).

The Chairman asked that Members having any issues to raise or requiring further detail on any of the items included in the notice, contact Nigel Cummings, Scrutiny Officer, for initial assistance.

In respect of item 160317/67 'Proposals to Establish a Company to Deliver Children's Services on behalf of the City Council', Mr Cummings advised that this would be referred to the Scrutiny Committee for consideration.

The Chairman advised that Scrutiny in its various guises from working groups to the parent Committee itself had repeatedly asked to meet with social workers and have

the ability to follow example cases from start to finish. Members had also asked to be able to meet with some of the looked after children outside of the formal committee setting and had asked that investigations be undertaken to find a mechanism that would allow them to do so. She asked that this was arranged as soon as possible.

6. RESOLVED that the Notice of Key Decisions be received and noted.

### **Annual Work Programme 2015/16**

The Head of Scrutiny and Area Arrangement submitted a report (copy circulated) attaching for Members' information, the work programme for the Committee's work being undertaken during the 2015/16 council year.

(For copy report – see original minutes).

7. RESOLVED that the information contained in the work programme be received and noted.

The Chairman then closed the meeting having thanked Members and Officers for their attendance and contributions to the meeting and for all the support that they had provided throughout the Municipal Year.

(Signed) N. WRIGHT,  
Chairman.